



A • M • E • R • I • C • A • N
A N T H R O P O L O G I C A L
A S S O C I A T I O N

Review: [untitled]

Author(s): Clayton Robarchek

Reviewed work(s):

Savages by Joe Kane

Source: *American Anthropologist*, New Series, Vol. 98, No. 4 (Dec., 1996), pp. 912-913

Published by: [Blackwell Publishing](#) on behalf of the [American Anthropological Association](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/681936>

Accessed: 19/01/2011 16:43

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=black>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Blackwell Publishing and American Anthropological Association are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *American Anthropologist*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

(many say the government, despite justified mistrust of it).

Location, social class, gender, and ethnicity qualify perceptions less than might be expected, but this might be in part an artifact of the interview schedule. Although settlers have different views about coping with forest destruction (dependency on government, coequal dialogue with government, developmentalist, conservationist, antifarmer, and fatalist positions, according to the categories constructed by the authors), pessimism is more common than optimism. Moreover, few perceive any connection between deforestation and increased aridity and other environmental problems, and deforestation itself is not seen as a crisis, perhaps because the claim comes from outsiders. The authors believe more education will help if the value placed on conservation is made consonant with prevailing values about profit and conspicuous consumption and if global social equity is promoted; as one of the colonists says, "you can't live off awareness" (p. 82). Many of the results of this book are similar to a comparable study by Carlos A. Soza M. in *Factores que inciden en la conciencia ecologica de los habitantes de la reserva de la biosfera Maya en el Departamento de El Petén* (Guatemala: Universidad de San Carlos de Guatemala, 1996), conducted in tropical Petén, just across the river from the Lacandona.

Culture and Global Change provides few specific policy recommendations, and although the book does make a contribution to the emerging field of political ecology, theoretical discussion is thin at times. Oddly, the book lacks a map, an index, and a presentation of the entire interview schedule. But no matter, for the strengths of the book are the "thick" quotations from the settlers, and what they say is revealing, moving, and often wise. The voices in *Culture and Global Change* should be heard by students in anthropology, political ecology, human geography, and Mesoamerican courses, as well as by the general public. ■

Savages. Joe Kane. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1996. 273 pp.

CLAYTON ROBACHEK
Wichita State University

There are a number of things wrong with this book by journalist and adventurer Joe Kane, but it should nonetheless be read by everyone who is concerned about environmental destruction and ethnocide. The author describes the situation confronting the "Huaorani" (Waorani) of Amazonian Ecuador as they try to come to grips with the forces of "development," especially "La Compania" (The Company)—the Waorani's unitary conception of the national and inter-

national oil companies, their contractors and subcontractors, and all the allied forces that are contributing to the destruction of traditional Waorani life.

They have powerful opponents, however, and "friends" whose motives are often, at best, questionable. Kane gives hints of the close collaboration among the U.S. and Ecuadorian governments, the national oil company, and Maxus Petroleum (the Dallas-based company that has the contract to extract oil from beneath the Waorani homeland). When a Waorani activist applied to come to the United States to testify before the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights about the impact of oil extraction, for example, the U.S. embassy in Quito initially denied him a visa.

He details the cynical attempts by Maxus to cultivate some of these young Waorani—with envelopes full of cash delivered in the middle of the night—and then to peddle them as "leaders" and "spokesmen" who have the authority to give the stamp of "Waorani approval" to La Compania's plans.

Even those who purport to support them have their own agendas and often do more harm than good. Infighting among various environmental groups in the United States and Ecuador scuttled a plan negotiated by the Natural Resource Defence Council that would have committed a minimum of \$10 million to improving the welfare of indigenous populations in the Napo region. Instead, La Compania now passes out a few outboard motors and builds a few clapboard schoolrooms. The oil still flows unhindered, and the indigenes get little but the pollution.

Other indigenous organizations dominated by the more numerous and land-poor Quichua and Shuar also purport to speak and negotiate for the Waorani, but when compensation is paid, it seldom, if ever, reaches them. Nor are these organizations much interested in the primary concern of the Waorani: the flood of colonists that inevitably follows the construction of pipeline roads.

Although the author did not set out to write an ethnography, readers should be aware that many of his ethnographic statements are simply wrong. Some of this is due to his inability to speak the appallingly difficult language, but some inaccuracies are more difficult to explain, such as his description of these quintessential swidden gardeners as "surviving mainly by hunting and gathering forest crops" (p.16).

Other of the ethnographic inaccuracies are, unfortunately, traceable to the author's prejudices. He alleges, for example, that "children are regularly beaten" in schools administered by missionary organizations. In a year and a half of residence in a number of Waorani communities, neither my wife nor I ever saw or heard of a child being beaten in school. In any case,

the missionary schools had been replaced by government-supervised schools with government-assigned teachers long before Kane's arrival.

He also alleges that the missionary schools were opposed to bilingual education, that "Huaorani were taught that to go into the forest was uncivilized" and that "no element of Huaorani culture was allowed to enter the curriculum" (p. 139). Whatever one's position may be on missionary activity, those statements (and a number of others in a similar vein) are—kindly put—hogwash. The schools, introduced under the auspices of the Summer Institute of Linguistics (SIL), utilized materials written in Waorani using the transcription system developed by SIL linguists. We have copies of many of these materials, and most deal with hunting, gardening, and other aspects of traditional Waorani life. Our neighbors emphasized that it was they themselves who demanded instruction in Spanish so that their children would be better able to deal with the outside world.

Kane also asserts that an assembly of these acephalous bands "at times . . . displayed the fanatical devotion to central authority that has, in one way or another, been the legacy of the Summer Institute of Linguistics throughout Latin America" (p. 171). Unfortunately, "devotion to central authority" is precisely what these autonomous kindreds have been unable to muster and is (as Kane implicitly recognizes elsewhere) one of the things that has impeded effective resistance to La Compania.

Another source of distortion is the author's attachment to the "natural man" and "noble savage" images. Sometimes the result is simply silly, such as his statement that "smell and touch are still the principal means by which the Huaorani gather information" (p. 37). In other cases, the distortions are more serious, as when he characterizes infanticide and the spearing of old people as "mercy killings." He also omits certain relevant facts: twice he refers to the spearing of a Catholic priest without mentioning that a nun was also killed, found naked, and pinned to the ground by spears; enamored of the romantic image of raiding by fearless "warriors" "protecting their territory," he neglects to mention that the vast majority of those killed in recent raids have been women and children.

None of this, however, obviates the book's genuine contribution. In portraying the complex interactions between the the Waorani and the industrial world, it shows that they are not merely passive victims in this process of transformation. They are certainly victims, but they are also trying valiantly, with their limited resources and understanding, to adapt to and influence the forces that are overwhelming them. ■

The Foraging Spectrum: Diversity in Hunter-Gatherer Lifeways. Robert L. Kelly. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995. 446 pp.

JOHN M. LINDLY AND GEOFFREY A. CLARK
Arizona State University

This is an important book, not because of path-breaking original research (there is little new here), but because Kelly presents a current, insightful, and well-written critique of the disparate approaches to research on what are known to anthropology as hunter-gatherers. He adopts the conceptual framework of behavioral ecology, defined by a focus on relationships between behavior and environment, firmly grounded in evolutionary theory, and distinguished from cultural ecology by an explicit concern with process questions. Since this foregrounds the relationships among human subsistence activities, biological reproduction, and learning in a social context, Kelly argues that behavioral ecology can best account for modern humans as biological and cultural animals and can best explain how we came to be the way we are today.

The first two chapters offer a historical perspective on hunter-gatherer studies and tackle the issue of why past approaches have failed to explain the diversity evident in the ethnographic record. Kelly argues that behavioral ecology can distinguish and explain the variability of hunter-gatherer adaptations better than cultural ecology, which tends to focus on homeostasis and the factors that create and maintain a steady state. The decision processes of (methodological) individuals are examined from the perspective of how they affect reproductive fitness and are combined with Boyd and Richerson's dual inheritance theory (*Culture and the Evolutionary Process*, University of Chicago Press, 1985) to allow Kelly to build models that are both informative and exciting.

Chapter 3 emphasizes hunter-gatherer subsistence strategies and contains a review of the different kinds of optimal foraging theory (OFT) used by anthropologists over the past 15 years to model forager subsistence strategies. Linear programming, diet breadth, and patch-choice models are described, and the strengths and weaknesses of each are assessed using examples. Kelly also discusses the role of imperfect knowledge of the environment, risk factors, and the various types of currency used in approximating input-output energy ratios when assessing the "goodness of fit" of these optimality models.

Hunter-gatherers have always been defined by their movements, relative to sedentary agriculturalists, across the landscape, and forager mobility is the subject of chapters 4 and 5. Mobility can be studied at different levels (that of populations, groups, individu-