oboler-is-female-husband-man-69-88

ELECTRONIC RESERVES REQUEST

Article in Journal

Donna Perry, Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology and Anthropology

phone:

Course Title and Number: ANTH 103--Introduction to Cultural Anthropology

FALL SEMESTER, 2003 Library Use Only: NO

Date Reading Assigned: 27 Oct 1,2003

for Electronic reserves only

This item meets the requirements of Brevity, Spontaneity, and Culmulative Effect to the best of

my knowledge

Signature_

ISBN / ISSN: 0014-1828

Book / Journal Title: Ethnology

Publication Date: 80

Volume: 19 **Pages:** 69-88

Chapter / Article title: "Is the Female Husband a Man? Woman/Woman Marriage Among the

Nandi of Kenya"

Chapter / Article author: Oboler, Regina Smith

Founder and Honorary Editor: George P. Murdock

Editors: Leonard Plotnicov and Arthur Tuden

Managing Editor: E. Dolores Donohue

Associate Editors:

Herbert Barry III, Laurel Bossen, Keith Brown, Terrence S. Kaufman, Margot Liberty, Hugo G. Nutini, John M. Roberts, Lee Sailer, Richard Scaglion, John Singleton.

International Editorial Board

A. Maesen, Belgium; Roberto Cardosa de Oliveira, Brasil; Richard F. Salisbury, Canada; Ján Podolák, Czechoslovakia; Esther Goody, England; Maurice Godelier, France; T. N. Madan, India; Koentjaraningrat, Indonesia; Eileen Kane, Ireland; Don Handelman, Israel; Vinigi L. Grottanelli, Italy; Takao Sofue, Japan; A. J. K. Köbben, Netherlands; Bruce G. Biggs, New Zealand; 'Wande Abembola, Nigeria; Fredrik Barth, Norway; Philip Mayer, South Africa; Carmelo Lisón-Tolosana, Spain; Ulf Hannerz, Sweden.

Policy

Ethnology welcomes articles by scientists of any country on any aspect of cultural anthropology. Theoretical or methodological discussions, however, will be published only if they specifically relate to some body of substantive data. Contributions may range in length from two to fifty printed pages.

Subscriptions

The subscription price is \$10 U.S. per annum for individual subscribers and \$17 U.S. per annum for institutional subscribers. Ethnology is also obtainable in exchange for journals or series in anthropology or any related field. Subscriptions and requests for exchange, as well as manuscripts and all communications, should be addressed to:

Editor, Ethnology, Department of Anthropology, University of Pittsburgh Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15260, U.S.A.

Manuscripts

All manuscripts should be original copies, double-spaced throughout, with liberal margins. Footnotes will be used only sparingly, and will be assembled at the end of the text. Sources cited will be listed in a separate bibliography, and references to them in the text will appear in parenthetical form, e.g., (Benedict 1935: 153). Copy for line drawings and all tables must be submitted in the form of glossy prints suitable for photo-engraving. Galley proofs will be sent to authors, but excessive changes will be billed to them. Authors, upon request, may order 100 reprints at cost. Unaccepted manuscripts will be returned if sender includes stamped, self addressed envelope.

Ethnology (ISSN 0014-1828) is published quarterly, during the months of January, April, July, and October, by the University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15260. Printed by the William Byrd Press, Inc. Richmond, Virginia, U.S.A. Second-class postage paid at Pittsburgh, Pa. and additional mailing offices.

Woman/Woman Marriage Among the Is the Female Husband a Man? Nandi of Kenya

Regina Smith Oboler Temple University

"No, I don't (carry things on my head). That is a woman's duty and nothing to do with me. I became a man and I am a man and that is all. Why should I assume

-Taptuwei, a Nandi female husbanc

only a man can (e.g., exchanging cattle for a wife, transmitting prop of western Kenya presents an example of how one society deals with cupies an intermediate position between male and female roles. role adopted by the female husband is sexually ambiguous and ocassertion that the female husband is a man masks the fact that the and informants go out of their way to rationalize any deviation theredomains, she makes every attempt to conform to male role behavior is resolved by the frequently reiterated public dogma that the female terty to heirs) represents an anomaly. In the Nandi case, the anomaly tain important attributes of the category "man" versus the category a problem of sexual classification. In a cultural system in which cer The institution of woman/woman marriage as practiced by the Nand from by a female husband. Within other sociocultural domains, the it is crucial that the female husband adopt male gender. Within these husband is a man. I will show that in specified sociocultural domains 'woman" are well defined, a woman who functions in certain ways as

purpose of the union is to provide a male heir. always be a woman of advanced age who has failed to bear a son. The spread in African patrilineal societies, although the way it function children. The basic institution of woman/woman marriage is wide varies from society to society. In Nandi, a female husband should By so doing, she becomes the social and legal father of her wife's marries (but does not have sexual intercourse with) another woman A female husband is a woman who pays bridewealth for, and thus

that the female husband is a man and behaves in exact accordance with the ideal model of the male role. Such areas are the managetion-livestock and, in the modern setting, land-should be held and of this property will be discussed in greater detail below. For now, let is transmitted through her to the sons of her wife. The exact status are unanimous in considering it of the utmost importance to insist ly implicate the issues of property and heirship, Nandi informants female husband's identification as a male is dependent on the social that the most significant property and primary means of producfemale husband's gender lies in her relationship to the property that in others lends a degree of clarity to the situation which is not presrole behavior and informants' dogmatic insistence that they in fact do other aspects of the cultural definition of the male role the weaker material sense. The further one moves away from these issues into dren and the responsibility to provide for the wife and children in a ment of family property, legitimate authority over the wife and chilcontext in which the identification is made. In contexts which directmanaged exclusively by men. I will argue that the strength of the it be said that it is an extremely important canon of Nandi ideology so. To say that a female husband is a man in certain contexts but not become both the female husband's own attempts to conform to male The argument presented here is that the key to the question of the

selective perception such as is typical of defensive strategies attemptconsidered to be men. The situation is one of rationalization and sion of labor, that they participate in public political discussions, that ing to maintain important but precarious dogmas. husbands do attend male initiation, but not because they are now circumcision rites as a result of their male status. In fact, most female they do not carry things on their heads, and that they attend men's female husbands completely adopt the male role in the sexual divifemale husbands' behavior that observation shows to be untrue: that nition of this category. This leads them to make assertions about have to carry through on this idea in terms of the total cultural defirelation to property. Once the ideological statement that the female husband is a man has been made, Nandi informants feel that they The cultural definition of the category "man" is not limited to the

Woman/Woman Marriage in Africa

case marriage cannot be defined as a transaction between the caterole boundaries and, as it were, changing sex? Or is the cultural role role of female husband an instance of some individuals crossing sex transcended, and a cross-culturally valid definition of marriage. Is the the problem of the conditions under which sex role barriers may be but hardly resolved, in recent publications.2 Its resolution bears on "man" not an inevitable concomitant of the husband role, in which The question of the gender of the female husband has been raised

> where female husbands may also be political leaders they are regarded as social males. The Nandi female husband is clearly culturalsocieties must be viewed as transactions between the male and fegories male and female? Riviere (1971) asserts that female husbands ly recoded as a man, though it is by no means clear that this is the case in all African societies (Huber 1969). Her assignment to the male cultural categories. Krige (1974) rejects this view, at least for the male role; husband is a sub-category of male, and marriages in all are invariably culturally recoded as male and take on other aspects of shown, is far from unambiguous and unproblematic. male role behavior in all spheres, however. Her position, as will be male gender does not mean that she easily and automatically assumes woman marriage in southern Bantu societies and concluded that Lovedu woman marriage. O'Brien (1977) has examined accounts of husband") to the services of a daughter-in-law that is the basis of Krige, it is the intrinsic right of a woman (the mother of the "female husband and wife may be of paramount importance. According to in which relationships created by a marital union other than those of be either male or female. Moreover, she maintains, Riviere's formuthe Lovedu, and argues that the husband role in Lovedu society may lation reflects a misunderstanding of the nature of African marriage,

pants in woman/woman marriages were interviewed on the subject. observation, and a large number of informants who were not particiing degrees of thoroughness. Information was also obtained through and wives from other communities were also interviewed with varytheir wives, were interviewed extensively. A few female husbands temale husbands living in the community, and wherever possible marriages in one Nandi community.3 Nine of ten known cases of The data reported here result from a study of nine woman/woman

THE ETHNOGRAPHIC SETTING

culture during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was classifies them as a pastoral people. They are well known for their as for home consumption. Maize is the staple subsistence crop. played a major role in their economy (Gold 1977). The Nandi at marked by a pastoral ideology. Cultivation, however, has always military organization and agressive cattle raiding practices and their whom Sutton (1970) calls Highland Nilotes. Huntingford (1953) milk, tea, and a variety of vegetables for the national market as well present are prosperous mixed-economy tarmers producing maize The Nandi are a section of Kenya's Kalenjin-speaking peoples,

neither the most traditional nor the most modernized in Nandi Disand 75 inches annually. Selected for its typicality, the community is trict. The average household (based on a random sample community and rainfall, distributed over the entire year, averages between 60 Nandi District, where elevation varies between 6,200 and 6,800 feet The research community is located in the north-central part of

census)⁴ contains 8.1 people and 9.1 adult cattle and holds 20.6 acres of land; 76.4 per cent of households grow tea, and 61.9 per cent hire a tractor for at least part of their annual plowing. Over 60 per cent of household heads are at least nominal Christians; most of them adherents of the Africa Inland Church, a fundamentalist body. Almost 51 per cent have had some primary education, 33.9 per cent perform some sort of part-time cash-gaining activity, and 16.8 per cent of ever-married male household heads are polygynous.

tion of marriage. stead. The sole (but weak) function of patrilineal clans is the regulaportant in today's social organization. Married couples reside patriwhereas the kokwet is not. Patrilocal extended families are still imgathering place (the settlement pattern is otherwise one of scattered a group of shops, businesses, public buildings, and a community appointed chief. It is the locus of political interaction. At its center is traditional local communities and presided over by a governmentlevel of the sublocation, an administrative unit made up of several day interaction took place. Today these functions take place at the nity (kokwet). It was the unit within which ceremonies were perwherever he wished. The most important unit was the local commuwas entitled to move with his family and herds to reside effectively rorosiek), patrilineal clans (but not corporate patrilineages), and patriseven rotating age-sets (ibinwek) for men, localized military units (polocally unless the husband buys a farm away from his father's homelocal extended families. While land was plentiful, every Nandi man formed and disputes settled in most cases and within which day-to-Traditional Nandi social organization was crosscut by a system of The sublocation is overwhelmingly endogamous,

The Property System and Woman/Woman Marriage

In Nandi ideology, women's rights in land and cattle are very limited. A girl may be given a heifer by her father if she is a virgin at her initiation and a woman may keep one cow as bridewealth for each of her daughters. Animals held by either spouse form the family estate but the bulk of the herd consists of animals a man receives from his father through inheritance or as gifts. This is augmented by cattle the family acquires through proceeds from their cash crops, as bridewealth for their daughters, etc. Husband and wife should jointly convealth for their daughters, etc. Husband and wife should jointly convealth those cattle in which the wife's rights predominate, though the husband has the right to control independently those cattle in which his rights predominate. If a woman leaves her husband, she has no right to take any animals with her. Many informants say that it is also better that she take no property with her to her husband so that this can never be a bone of contention between them.

Management of land and cattle is a male prerogative, although informants will admit that when the husband is incapable of administering the family estate it would not be wrong for the wife to assume responsibility. The exception to the rule that women do not manage

property is the case of widows. Widows can hold property in their own right and make decisions regarding the property which they hold in trust for their minor sons. The lack of congruence with public ideology that this fact presents is dealt with by the typical male claim (contrary to observable events) that effective control of the family estate is held not by the widow but by the deceased man's brother. This man may or may not be the woman's levirate husband.

share regardless of how many children the mother has. A man can marry only by using those of his father's cartle which were allotted to a share of her husband's property at the time of her marriage. The which they themselves have acquired. is a new phenomenon in Nandi, and though it would seem that there husband's family at marriage, she takes his clan identity, and her chilchildren, after an absence of many years, and her husband will take become a prostitute. All this does not change her marriage and property rights. She remains the legal wife of the man who first married options are so rarely invoked that divorce may be said to be absent sible now to obtain a legal divorce through the courts, both these considered to be a once in a lifetime event for a Nandi woman house is entitled to an equal share is never abrogated. Marriage is wife is added to her husband's menage, the basic principle that her each wife's house is entitled obviously changes as each additional co-wives. Although the effective share of the family estate to which may his father allot him cattle from the herd of one of his mother's his mother's house, or those which came as bridewealth for his own full sisters; he should not use his half-sister's bridewealth cattle, nor evenly among sets of full siblings, each set receiving exactly the same complex. All property held by a polygynous family is ideally divided system is that which Gluckman (1950) has called the house-property ministering the family estate are critical in its transmission. A woman's "house" (patrilineal descendants) is automatically endowed with It is possible, however, for women to transmit to their sons property ceptional circumstances, I found none in the course of the research must be cases on record of children affiliating matrilaterally in exdren's only legitimate rights to filiate are with his family. Illegitimacy transmit any rights to this land. A woman is incorporated into her to live on the land of her father and brothers, but she can in no way her back. She can even return and take up her rights to her husband's her, and her children remain his legal heirs. She can return, with Separation, however, does occur. A woman may leave her husband for a period of many years or even for life. She may live with a man in property after his death. A woman retains throughout her life a right the meantime and have children by him. She may go to a town and Though a traditional divorce proceeding existed, and while it is pos-Women-wives and mothers-though supposedly barred from ad

Traditionally, the property of a woman's house could only be transmitted to male heirs. As it was inappropriate for a woman to hold property, it could not be passed to daughters. If an heir was

a female husband should bear sons who will become their female is that not every woman gives birth to a son. Woman/woman mar-riage is one solution to this problem. The intention is that the wife of and very unfortunate if this should happen. The demographic reality completely lacking, the property would have to revert to a man's sons by other wives or to his brothers, but it was considered wrong father's house's male heirs in the property system.

regard to their wives and children. serve procedures for avoiding contamination by ritual pollution with Female husbands, like their male counterparts, are required to obtion rituals in the hope that the infertility will thereby be cured.) hopes of curing her infertility or inability to bear a son. (In Nandi, an most cases will already have been admitted to male initiation in adornment. She normally stops attending female initiation and in would also be expected to adopt to some extent male dress and with regard to her wife, and is supposed to abandon all women's work. She theoretically acquires certain public prerogatives of men; a woman). She has all the nonsexual prerogatives of a male husband nik). She can no longer have sexual intercourse with a man (nor with infertile person of either sex is admitted to the opposite sex's initiafor example, the right to speak in public meetings. In the past, she that she has been promoted to male status (kagotogosta komostab mure-A woman who has taken a wife is said to become a man. It is said

ings of 15.8 (versus 20.6) acres and herds of 7 (versus 9.1) adult are not exceptionally rich. In fact, those on whom data are available are not as wealthy as the community average, with average land holdried to a wealthy woman rather than a poor man, temale husbands marriage, and although informants cite the advantages of being mar-Although property is the crux of the institution of woman/woman

MOTIVATIONS OF THE PRINCIPALS IN WOMAN/WOMAN

But why does she choose this means to her end rather than another? fairly clear-cut; it is the acquisition of a male heir for her property The motivation of a woman who becomes a female husband is

sure to know of the approaching confinement of any pregnant girl an who happened to be present at the birth. Thus it was easier to adopt a child in the past than presently, as barren women would be mothers were killed unless requested for adoption by a barren womneighboring Abaluhyia. It is difficult to find any child, particularly a him. The children bought by Nandi women usually come from the mally, money) to the parents of the child, who relinquish all ties to "buy" a male child by the payment of a large sum (these days, norable to a woman whose house has no heir. First, she may adopt or Nandi child, available for sale. In the past, children born to unwed There are two options other than woman/woman marriage avail-

> usually raise their own children. Moreover, by the time a woman old for adoption to be a realistic option. Thus, adoption is relatively resigns herself to the fact that she will not bear a son, she is often too Today, although infanticide has been eliminated, unwed mothers

form of marriage, the sonless woman's youngest daughter is retained at home and her "husband" is said to be the house or its center post. or "marrying the center post" (tunisiet ab got, kitunis toloita). In this woman/woman marriage. recent innovation but has not gained much popularity relative to her sons will inherit the house's property. The custom is said to be This daughter will have children by self-selected sexual partners and Another option is the institution known as "marrying the house"

It seems that woman/woman marriage is the most commonly adopted of these options in the case of lack of a male heir but only a the youngest age cohort over 40, among whom many who are candidates to be female husbands have not yet made the decision to per cent of those ever married and 24.5 per cent of those who bore no sons ultimately became female husbands. This includes women of tually do so. From a large-scale survey of marital and fertility hisof a total of 286 households were headed by female husbands. The respectively, of women with no male heir married; 6.8 per cent and 6 marry. For the older two age cohorts, 39 per cent and 27 per cent, tories it was found that among women over 40 years of age, only 4-3 minority of women who are eligible to become female husbands acmale husbands. In the community intensively studied, at least ten out per cent, respectively, of ever-married women ultimately became feper cent. rate for female husbands as household heads, then, is just under 3

cause of the prohibition on sexual intercourse which the role entails. to me that some women may resist becoming female husbands beadjusting to another person in the household. It has been suggested cite personal reasons for their failure to marry, e.g., the difficulty of who are hard-working, well-mannered, and from good families. Ocand maintain that they will marry as soon as they find willing girls ing female husbands. They point out that they will not marry anyone commonly given by women who were prime candidates for becomwife may have difficulty in finding one. This was the reason most cattle to acquire a wife. Second, a woman who is prepared to take a casionally sonless old women who have not become female husbands to warrant an heir, especially if her house lacks enough bridewealth female husband. First, her house's property may not be large enough Several factors may prevent a sonless woman from becoming a

options? Two female husbands said that they would have adopted sons but could find no available male children. Two did adopt sons but both children were sickly. One died in infancy and the other Why should a woman choose to marry a wife in favor of other

woman marriage entails a rise in status for the female husband. syncratic reasons for choosing woman/woman marriage. Over and "marry the house." Still others provided various personal and idioson who might not even survive to reproductive age when, for the above all these explanations, there is the general reason that woman same amount, one can acquire a grown woman who will reproduce to pay money equivalent to a bridewealth payment for just one infant property. Another female husband explained that it is bad economics turned out to be simple-minded and thus not a suitable heir to the have daughters who wished to marry their boyfriends and refused to herself several times over in a few years. Three female husbands

common reason why a girl is considered unmarriageable by men is mental defect—fail to attract a male husband. These days, the most ally girls who for one reason or another—for example, a physical or marry her. Such girls quite often become the wives of female husthat she already has a child or is pregnant by a man who refuses to Why do women become wives of female husbands? They are usu-

seven cattle, 600 shillings and three sheep; an extremely high amount for Nandi bridewealth. tween four and six adult cattle, one sheep or goat, and money ranging between none and 500 shillings. During the same period, out of remale husband gave seven cattle and 500 shillings, and another gave cases fell within the range of the amounts given by the men, but one seven cases of woman/woman marriage, the amounts given in five who married between 1970 and 1977 gave bridewealth ranging bewealth of higher value than that given by men. Males in my sample dency of female suitors, being very anxious to marry, to give brideand beat them. Another possible motivating factor is the slight tenmale husbands are less likely than men to quarrel with their wives woman marriage. Female husbands are said to be less likely to quesual and social freedom for the wife as a reason to prefer woman property will always be there." Second, informants cite greater sexput it, "When you actually live with a man the love may fade, but the married by a wealthy woman than by a poor man. As one informant an/woman marriage. Most informants agree that it is better to be men but they and their families preferred to accept an offer for womscore. Several said that they had received offers of marriage from ence. The wives of temale husbands are themselves divided on this a man if it is possible, while others claim that there are many girls who choose to be married by female husbands as a matter of prefer-Some informants maintain that a girl will always prefer marriage to

Domestic Relations in Female Husband-Headed HOUSEHOLDS

together in actual household situations. What, then, are the typical Female husbands, their wives and children are real people living

> are frequently significant in these interactions. Another significant patterns of interaction in these female husband-headed households? female husband's male husband, her co-wives and their children-Besides the husband, wife and children, other parties—such as the party is the wife's consort, who may or may not be a regular visitor in

gether in a common dwelling. The female husband, in these cases, several cases, female husbands and their wives are found living toand lived side by side with their new families as brothers might. In maintained that she had not yet had an opportunity to provide sepahusband married young wives at the same time, divided their plot, know of at least one case in which both a barren woman and her however, be within the same compound and in close proximity. I that of the female husband to facilitate the wife's relationship with the compound. ner consort.6 The dwellings of the female husband and wife should The wife and her children ideally occupy a separate dwelling from

of the division of labor by sex). In the main, female husbands avoid building, thatching, and slaughtering. Both sexes engage in herding, cattle, clearing bush, digging drainage ditches, tencing, house-frame Jobs technically reserved for men include plowing, innoculating and washing clothes are supposed to be exclusively female chores. rying water and collecting firewood, sweeping, plastering the house, in male husband-headed households. Cooking, washing utensils, carrate housing arrangements for the wife but would do so soon. not sexually coded. holds. Most female husbands take an active role in tasks which are reserved for men but employ men to do such work for their housetheir advanced age, they are not often observed doing heavy work female tasks, although with less rigidity than do men. Because of The division of labor is said by informants to be much the same as

and milk. When we have finished eating I say, 'Wife, come and take ried pair, and in the afternoon the female husband is free to "go for a walk" while the wife takes care of household chores. Female husbands do typically behave as men in reserving most of their afternoons for socializing but they differ little from other old women in should go to the fields together in the morning, like any other marfirms this description. informant put it, "When a visitor comes, I sit with him outside and male husbands and their wives when entertaining visitors. As one this respect. Female husbands and their wives also behave exactly as different from that between a male husband and his wife. They relationship between a female husband and her wife should be no the dishes. Then I go for a walk with the visitor." Observation con-Informants maintain that, except for the absence of the sex act, the

the wife of a male husband to be relieved of her domestic responsi-The wife of a female husband probably has more opportunity than

bilities such as in the case of illness or a family crisis which causes her to return temporarily to her parents' home. The female husband is more able and willing to fend for herself in the domestic domain than is the typical male husband. If the two women are on good terms, the female husband will usually sympathize with the problems of her wife, having been a wife herself. Women often cited the tendency of female husbands to be less harsh and demanding as one of the advantages of woman/woman marriage.

In terms of informal interaction, it seems that female husbands and their wives enjoy more casual companionship than do ordinary couples. More opportunities for friendly and companionable conversation between female husband and wife arise since the female husband spends more time in her compound than a male husband. This is partly the result of preference and partly the result of habit. Female husbands are supposed to spend most of their time socializing with men and most of them claim that they do, but observation does not support this claim. One informant confided what is probably true for many other female husbands as well, "Men like fighting, and I don't like being with them most of the time."

No female husband would admit that she is not totally in charge of important household decisions (e.g., farm management and money allocation) but several women stated that another advantage of marriage to a female husband is the opportunity to participate more equally in household decisions.

The female husband is technically in the same position of authority The female husband is technically in the same position of authority over her wife as a male husband. All wives agreed that they must ask permission from their female husbands to go away from the compound, except for local, short-term activities such as marketing and visiting neighbors. The husband supervises the wife's behavior and has the right to beat her if she errs. It is agreed, however, that female husbands rarely invoke this right. This is not to say that female husbands never beat their wives, but on the whole wives of female husbands see their domestic situations as atypically harmonious. "A man who finds a mistake with his wife only wants to beat her. A woman just scolds and that is enough."

Traditionally, the female husband appointed a man to act as consort to her wife. This man would most likely be a younger clan-mate of the female husband's husband—possibly his younger brother, his brother's son, or the son of one of his other wives. It could never be the female husband's husband himself nor could it be any of her own patrilineal kin. These days, however, wives are insistent on choosing their own consorts, and usually make sure that the female husband agrees in advance to this arrangement before consenting to the marriage. Where the female husband tries to appoint a consort for her wife against the wife's will, the latter remains adamant. The wife sees her sexual autonomy as one of the chief advantages to her of woman/ woman marriage and will not surrender it lightly.

confirm, that they are not promiscuous, but have one long-standing relationship with a male friend (sandet). This man visits the wife in cannot demand her sexual fidelity or any wifely services, although she usually cooks for him when he visits her. He has no right to beat not be acquainted with the rest of the household, including the fewith the wife's child cannot harm her consort, the biological father, times of difficulty. Agreement is complete that pollution connected visit the compound openly and be treated as a friend of the family male husband. Some informants implied that it would be bad form friendship, but he is not obligated to do so. The consort may or may because he is not the legal father. they would ever request money or services from the wife's consort in by the village elders. Most female husbands vigorously denied that for the latter to acknowledge him, while others said that he could her house on a more or less regular basis. His responsibility is to give her if she displeases him. If he should do so, she can have him fined The consort has no rights of any kind in the wife or her children. He her children and nothing else. He may occasionally give her a gift of Nevertheless, the wives of female husbands and other observers

Female husbands assume the formal role of father to their wives children. The relationship between fathers and their young children is normally reserved and distant and the relationship between female fathers and their children is no different. Female husbands believe that they can be harmed by pollution connected with the wife's children and treat them with the same cool aloofness displayed by male fathers. In relation to their other kin, for example, their daughters children, they maintain the same kinship role behavior as before. It is quite remarkable to watch a female husband treat her daughter's child in the warm affective style of a grandmother at one moment and her wife's child with the reserve of a father at the next.

Female fathers, like male fathers, are responsible for the discipline of their wives' children and children reportedly respect and fear female fathers as much as they would male fathers. One of the most important areas of significance of the father role is the father's responsibility to care for the wife's children materially. That they meet this requirement was constantly stressed by female husbands.

Cases of separation and estrangement occur between female husbands and their wives, just as they occur in ordinary marriages. In the beginning of my inquiries on this subject, some highly acculturated informants told me that girls do not want to be married by women and usually run away if such a marriage is arranged for them. Subsequent contacts and interviews with the principals in woman/woman marriages have convinced me that this is not the case. The usual pattern in woman/woman marriage is one of harmony and mutual respect between husband and wife which, as in ordinary marriages, often develops into real affection. As one wife said, "I respect Kogo as I would have respected a man if he had married me."

Both the female husband and her wife gain status in the community through a stable marriage. The female husband gains descendants and promotion to male status, after spending years in the unenviable status of a barren or sonless wife. The wife is likely to be a girl for whom getting married has been difficult. If she already has children, she gains inheritance and clan status for them. Otherwise, she is licensed to bear legitimate children. If she has made the mistake of premarital pregnancy and thus lost face in the community and the chance to make a good marriage with a man, she is able to recoup her position through marriage with a woman. Most wives of female husbands believe that their situation compares favorably with that of ordinary wives in many respects.

Woman/Woman Marriage and Kinship Terminology

All Nandi informants strongly insist that a woman who takes a wife becomes a man and (except for the absence of sexual intercourse with her wife) behaves in all social contexts exactly as would any ordinary man. Aspects of the kinship terminology belie this assumption, however. No informant gave the kinship terms to be used by a female husband and her wife towards each other's various relatives as exactly the same as those used by a two-sex couple. Therefore, consideration of the degree to which kinship terms used between female husbands and their wives and other relatives conform to terminological usages in cases where the husband is a man is relevant to the issue of the female husband's gender. To what extent are kin terms used in kinship dyads involving female husbands the same as those used in dyads involving male husbands? Is the female husband a man with regard to the use of kinship terms?

Informant accounts of the correct usage of kin terms by parties related through woman/woman marriages are far from consistent. Consistency is greatest in the case of those terms which relate directly to the roles of the people concerned in the management and transmission of the family estate. In some cases, the responses are not those which we would expect if we view the female husband as a man. This seeming paradox is resolved, however, when it is understood that many of these terms encode relationships between patrilineal extended families and do not really relate to the female husband as an individual. Agreement about correct usage is greatest where the terms in question encode marriage and property exchange relations between patrilineal extended families, and relationships significant to the transmission of property within patrilineal extended families.

The ideology that the female husband is a man, however, is so strong that even where agreement that the correct term is other than what would be expected if the female husband were considered the same as a man is effectively complete, some informants will deviate in the attempt to make their position logically coherent. A female

husband will say, for example, "Really the children should call me baba, because I am their father." Still, there is complete agreement that this is not the appropriate term for children to use for female

In some other parts of western Kenya, e.g., Huber (1969) on the Simbiti, a Gusii or Kuria sub-group, the role which a woman who marries assumes toward her bride is that of mother-in-law and the kinship terminology adjusts itself to make sense with the insertion of kinship terminology adjusts itself to make sense with the insertion of kinship terminology adjusts itself to make sense with the insertion of kinship terminology adjusts itself to make sense with the insertion of propriate to this model of the female husband's role accounts for many of the inconsistencies in the Nandi kin term data. There is evidence for the general diffusion northward of the institution of woman/woman marriage among the Kalenjin (Kipsigis \rightarrow Nandi \rightarrow woman/woman marriage among the Kalenjin (Kipsigis from Keiyo) and it is very likely that it originally diffused to Kipsigis from the neighboring Gusii. Thus the contradiction in the Nandi terminology may reflect a continuing process of adapting the Gusii pattern to the Nandi cultural context. Some examples of the consistencies and inconsistencies in informants' accounts of the kin terms appropriate to woman/woman marriages will suffice to demonstrate these

There is virtual informant unanimity about the terms appropriate—There is virtual informant unanimity about the terms appropriate-ly used between the female husband and her wife, and the wife's children. The female husband refers to them as "my wife" and "my children" but they do not reciprocate with the terms they would use for a male husband/father and instead call the female husband kogo, "grandmother." From the standpoint of the children, this usage is consistent with the Gusii-type terminological model but it is not clear why the wife should call her husband "grandmother." Since kogo is a term of extremely broad application which can be used for any old woman, one possibility is that its use by the wife to her female husband is a way of avoiding the issue of what kin term is appropriate for the latter and reflects the ambiguity of her position.

Informants are equally divided on whether the female husband's wife and daughter should call each other by terms appropriate to a wife and daughter should call each other and "child," the terms that female-husband-as-man model ("mother" and "child," the terms that would be used between a man's younger wife and his children by an older co-wife) or a female-husband-as-mother-in-law model ("husband's sister"/"brother's wife"). Likewise, there is lack of agreement on whether the wife's children should call the female husband's siblings by the terms for father's brother and father's sister, as they would if she were a male father, or by the terms for grandmother and grandfather, which they would use by extension if it were the female husband's son who was their male father.

One of the points of greatest informant agreement, however, is the use of the term bamuru. Ordinarily this term means "husband's brother/sister's husband" (woman speaking). Informants declare that the wife of a female husband should never call the female husband's

highly anomalous for a woman. The female husband's wife calls her husband's co-wife's son basence of her relationship to them—cattle-exchanging wite-taker—is guish her from a male son-in-law terminologically because the esband. Further, it makes sense that her wife's family should not distinalready been fully incorporated into the patrilineal family of her hussame term they use for a male son/brother-in-law (sandana) and she man. The wife's family as a whole calls the female husband by the bridewealth exchange and marriage alliance, the female husband has uses the reciprocal term (kapyugoi) toward them. For the purposes of muru to address the female husband, just as though the latter were a Some informants say that the wife's sister should use the term bashould use the term bamuru for the temale husband's co-wife's son. also explains why most informants agree that a female husband's wife own brother bamuru. This is because the term bamuru has to do with is this family that is allied to the wife's family by the marriage. This for men of a woman's own generation of a family related to her natal family as wife-takers. It is the estate of the family of a female husband's male husband which provides bridewealth for her wife and it the relationship between families allied by marriage—it is reserved

muru because of his status as heir to a part of the estate that has provided her bridewealth. She cannot use this term for the female husband's brother because he is a member of an entirely different patrilineal family. The property and alliance relationship in this case makes the assimilation of terms surrounding the female husband model impossible. The wife's family calls the female husband model impossible. The wife's family calls the fecause she functions toward them as a cattle-giving wife-taker and is no different from a male son-in-law in this crucial respect. Since the property issue is the crux of the entire institution of woman/woman marriage, the areas where there is least confusion. Lack of unanimity among informants about terminology in cases that are more peripheral to matters of property leaves open the question of the female husband's gender status (male husband versus female mother-in-law) and allows for contextual shifts between the male and female roles.

The kin terms used between female husbands and their wives and the respective relatives of both show numerous deviations from the terms used in cases where the husband is a man. These deviations are not random but are patterned in the direction of the female-husband-as-mother-in-law model current among some Bantu peoples of western Kenya. Some confusion results because informants consciously maintain the ideology that, except for sexual relations, the female husband's position is exactly the same as that of a male husband, and try to bend kin terminological usage to support this assertion. Nandi terminology reflects an interplay between these two models for woman/woman marriage.

IS THE FEMALE HUSBAND A MAN?

Nandi informants know very well that the female husband is not a man in the sense that she has changed her physiological sex or all her sex typed behaviors. The impossibility of completely changing the habitual actions of a lifetime is recognized. Everyone is of course aware that the female husband is not really a man but it is a grave insult for anyone to call attention to this fact. What, then, is the claim that the female husband is a man intended to encode? What does the female husband have in common with a man that makes it essential for her to be defined as such? The oft reiterated statement of the female husband's masculine identity is a cultural dogma (Leach female husband is an anomaly: she is a woman who of necessity behaves as no woman in her culture should. Her situation forces her to haves as no woman in her culture should. Her situation forces her to assume male behavior in certain areas that are crucial to the cultural definition of the differences between the sexes. These areas have to do with the management and transmission of the family estate.

Behaviors associated with men are not all equally important in the attempt to maintain the ideological fiction that the woman who has taken a wife is now a man. Some are essential, and the female husband insists that for these her behavior conforms to the masculine ideal. Others can be more or less ignored. Female husband is thus a category which, in some sense, occupies an intermediate position between male and female.

Unanimity about the norms to which the female husband's behavior must conform is greatest in those areas that are closest to her role in the management and transmission of the family estate: her role in the domestic division of labor, as husband to her wife and father to the wife's children, and the cessation of sexual intercourse. There is less agreement regarding other aspects of the male role such as conserving primarily with men, speaking in public meetings, attending men's initiation, refraining from carrying things on the head, and the manner of relating to children other than those of the wife and other

Female husbands tend to avoid such feminine chores as household maintenance, laundry, and wood and water carrying, although typically with less rigidity than do men. Several female husbands said that they can help with the milking, as many young men do nowadays. Cooking is the most indispensible domestic job and ideally should be done by the wife. Even informants who say that it is possible for a female husband to cook under unusual circumstances insist that she should never do so at her wife's hearth, which she may not approach for any purpose. This is an example of the contextuality of the female husband's gender status; in relation to female symbols connected with her wife she is quintessentially a man.

A female husband should not see her wife naked because in relation to her she is a husband and therefore a man, but she may see any

kerek very seriously because it can induce rapid aging and skin disa female husband and that she can therefore take these prohibitions warrior, some informants say that this is naturally of little concern to a negative effect on those manly qualities which insure success as a affected by feminine/child pollution (kerek) due to close contact with plains why it is not felt by the genitor. Since kerek is believed to have magic performed during the traditional wedding ceremony. This exthe wife's child. The effect is reportedly at least partly the result of wife's labor. It is generally believed that the female husband can be other woman naked. A female husband is never present during her less seriously than do men. Others assert that female husbands take

and therefore a woman. In this situation it is perhaps easiest to see clothes for her male husband because in relation to him she is a wife relation to her wife she is a man (husband); but she can still wash vided them by her wife. She will not wash her own clothes because in some or all of these to her male husband while herself being prothe ambiguity and contextuality of the female husband's gender posiices to both of them, or the female husband may continue to provide husband may be responsible for providing nonsexual domestic servhave another wife living in the compound, the wife of the female If the male husband of a female husband is still alive, and does not

as the equivalent of personally doing them. other, their taking responsibility for having male tasks done is coded fact doing work that is equally appropriate to men or women. On the that female husbands are doing the work of men when they are in sion of labor. On the one hand, informants make it a point to argue husbands are considered to have assumed the male role in the divichange the behavior patterns of a lifetime. In spite of this, female to perform certain aspects of the male role and it is now too late to which people now conceptually defined as men have never learned is not a complete fallacy. In general, however, this is a situation in were occasionally observed fencing, the claim that they do male tasks ate to both sexes—cultivation and herding—but reinterpret it as male work in order to affirm their male status. Since female husbands uous activity. Female husbands are active in types of work approprigrounds that they are old and no longer able to engage in such strenly reserved for men. This they rationalize, when challenged, on the Female husbands are rarely observed doing work that is technical-

ample, temale husbands say they typically converse with men rather make claims that are sometimes contrary to observation. For extant to the cultural definition of this category. This leads people to conform to male role behavior. Nevertheless, since female husbands logical consistency to insist that they behave as men in areas imporare said to be men, many informants find it necessary for the sake of In extradomestic contexts it is less important that female husbands

> carry things on her head, act as midwife to women other than her sion to marry a wife. Yet female husbands all implied that they at wife, or hold another woman's baby. Many informants say that there men. Neither is there unanimity as to whether a female husband can than women, but the observational evidence is to the contrary. All husband's gender position is ambiguous. is nothing wrong in the latter two behaviors but some deny that a agreed that it is at least not usual, since they are now regarded as temale husbands to continue attending female initiation but it is therefore men. There is disagreement as to whether it is possible for tend male initiation as the result of their status as female husbands, woman's barrenness or failure to bear a son and preceded her deciinitiation. It was revealed, however, that in all cases this is due to the but admit that they have never done so. All but one attend men's say they can participate in public meetings and political discussions baby because she is a man. Thus in many areas of action the female female husband should ever be present at a birth or hold any young

are not immediately relevant to the management of property, they are relevant to the issue of heirship. They are the categories of thought and action through which the relationship between the man would be too thoroughly confounded to be withstood. conceive, both the issue of inheritance and the dogma that she is a still the danger that the impossible will somehow occur. If she should worthy. Though she is presumed to be unable to conceive, there is insistence that the female husband abandon her sex life is also noteproperty holder and heir is acted out. With regard to heirship, the avoidance of kerek and close physical contact with the wife's children ment of the heirship to the family estate. Though issues such as behavior, in contexts that are closely connected with the managemale behavior, and informants rationalize any deviation from such The female husband makes her greatest attempt to conform to

same as a man is the legitimate right to hold and manage land and distinguishes a female husband from a woman and makes her the tween patrilineal families are involved. Thus the major factor which spective relatives. Most uniformity exists in the areas where property used between principals in woman/woman marriages and their rewith which informants maintain the ideology that the female huslivestock and transmit them to heirs. transmission within patrilineal families and property exchange beband's gender as encoded in the kinship terminology appropriately above that there is a great deal of ambiguity about the female husband is a man in the area of kinship terminology. It has been shown The issue of heirship and property is also relevant to the strength

erty and heirship, female husband is an intermediate category between man and woman. While this is not made explicit in the cultural ideology, the recognition of this situation is often implicit. An old Particularly in contexts less immediately relevant to issues of prop-

nearly equal to men than are other women, but men are always ahead who have married wives have limited prerogatives. They are more moting, which means that you are still under somebody. So women when you are promoted there is still that person who does the proman explained it this way: "It is just like getting a promotion. Always

CONCLUSION

category "man" in Nandi culture have to do with management of the complex. Moreover, some of the most important atributes of the tradiction between men's and women's rights in the house-property and can never be revoked. The argument developed in the preceding pages is essentially that woman marriage is the outcome of this conwomen and rights therein devolve to a woman's house at marriage stock, the means of production, but these are transmitted through Among the Nandi, only men can hold and manage land and live-

actual man in various areas of ideology and activity has been redogma is diminished. viewed in an attempt to show that the closer one gets to issues of status, role and behavior of a female husband approximates that of an ing upon the family estate and heirship to it. The degree to which the a man are most pronounced in the areas of life that have most bearband is a man, the further the remove from these issues the more this property and heirship the stronger is the dogma that the female husthat the female husband is a man, and why her attempts to behave as culturally recoded as a man to reduce the contradiction implicit in exchanger of property is an extremely anomalous being. Thus she is cause of her special circumstances, but a female holder, manager and culturally conceptualized as a man. She must manage property beher role with regard to property. This explains why informants insist These two facts taken together explain why the female husband is

an impressive edifice of evasion, rationalization, and selective perdogma that the female husband is a man comes to be defended with is in these areas (e.g., political participation, male initiation) that the and female. In areas removed from the realm of property relations, important to the cultural construct man, the ambiguity is greatest. It the female husband becomes an intermediate category between male domain of property relations, into other domains. In some senses, sistency and thus extend this ideology, which is so important in the thus not crucial to the female husband's male status but generally has an independent existence. Informants strive for logical con-Once articulated, the ideology that the female husband is a mar

1. For assistance in arriving at this interpretation, I am indebted to Cathy Small, Lorraine Sexton, Denise O'Brien and Diane Freedman, although I remain solely

responsible for any errors of logic in its development. I am further indebted to

O'Brien 1972), it has received very little detailed anthropological study. A handful of ethnographic accounts by Herskovits (1937) on Dahomey; Krige and Krige (1943) and Krige (1974) on Lovedu; van Warmelo and Phophi (1948) on Venda; Evans-Pritchard (1951) on Nuer; Huber (1969) on Simbiti; and Obbo (1976) on context of the entire range of institutions found in African societies in which a woman can pay bridewealth to acquire predominant rights in a wife. In some of these societies, the relationship between the two women is not that of "husband" and "wife." Therefore, I choose to use "woman/woman marriage" as a general term for the institution, and "female husband" as the term for a woman who takes a wife marriages involve women. O'Brien (1977: 110) prefers to drop the term "woman marriage" in favor of "female husband." The Nandi institution clearly belongs in the to denote the institution I am discussing. This term is somewhat confusing, since all Jennifer Jeptoo Kosut, who assisted in the collection of the data.

The term "woman marriage" is commonly used in the anthropological literature societies has been briefly noted in various ethnographic sources (summarized by 2. Although the existence of woman/woman marriage in a large number of African and is considered to stand as "husband" to her according to the rules of their culture.

Kamba contain more than passing references to woman/woman marriage. The most complete accounts are those of Krige (1974) and Huber (1969).
3. This study was funded by grants from the National Institute for Mental Health, the National Science Foundation, and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship in the National Science Foundation, and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship in the National Science Foundation, and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship in the National Science Foundation, and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship in the National Science Foundation, and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship in the National Science Foundation, and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship in the National Science Foundation, and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship in the Foundation. It was carried out during my tenure as a Research Associate of the Institute for Development Studies, University of Nairobi, Kenya. To all of the

above, I wish to express my appreciation for making the research possible.

4. The census included 116 households, or a 40 per cent sample of the approximately 286 households in Kaptel sublocation. The list of 286 households from which the random sample was selected was compiled from lists provided by sub-location Chief Paulo arap Lelei and kokwet elders. This was the most accurate infor-

ton for completely childless women and girls with children who have not inherited 5. Woman/woman marriage is not declining in popularity at present, but several factors may ultimately work against it. For example, there are the opposition of property. The institution of woman/woman marriage is in the process of diffusing inherit family property. Woman/woman marriage will probably continue as an op-Christians and the growing idea that daughters as well as sons should be eligible to mation available. from the Nandi to other Kenyan societies.

7. Langley (1979) says that the female husband "raised children either to her own or her husband's clan," that some of her informants believed that the wife's consort traditionally the dwelling of a family, with cooking hearth, overhead storage compartment, and a room for sheep and goats. The latter is usually a smaller one-room is consistently referred to as got, the female husband's fairly consistently as sigiroinet. 6. In Nandi, dwelling structures are of two kinds, got and sigiroinet. The former is band. All these points are vehemently and unanimously denied by the scores of approved by the female husband's own kin group as well as that of her male husshould belong to the female husband's own kin group and that the consort had to be threplace of the sigiroinst is not generally used as a cooking hearth. The wife's house friends and now houses adolescent boys and unmarried men or a man who wishes a place to sleep away from the family. The most significant distinction is that the dwelling which traditionally served as sleeping quarters for warriors and their girl-District and other areas of Nandi settlement. informants I interviewed about woman/woman marriage in various areas of Nandi

8. The distance between father and child stems to a large degree from traditional pollution beliefs. Kerek is the Nandi word for a polluting substance believed to emababies. Its effect on a man, particularly the child's own father, is to weaken his murenotet, or manly qualities. He loses his prowess in warfare and becomes stupid, weak and indecisive. At the birth of a child, a husband leaves his wife's house and is nate from newborn infants and from women due to their close association with

most cases, and most young people do not admit to believing in kerek. months old. Today, the period of avoidance has been shortened to about a month, in not completely reincorporated into the household until the child is eight to twelve

with the child is ordinarily distant. Second, some male adult relative is always living in or in close proximity to the female husband's compound and this man, be he the female husband's brother-in-law, the son of her co-wife, or whoever, serves as a restricted to a nuclear family socialization context. male role model. The question of the absence of a male role model is specifically role model. This concern is needless on two grounds. First, the father's relationship household will not have a gender identity problem as the result of lacking a male 9. Readers may wonder whether a male child raised in a female husband-headed

kin term material from which these conclusions are drawn. This analysis is the sub-10. Space considerations make it impossible to provide an exhaustive analysis of the

lect of a future article.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Gluckman, M. Evans-Pritchard, E. E. desia and the Zulu of Natal. African Systems of Kinship and Marriage, ed. A. R. Radcliffe-Brown and D. Forde, pp. 166-206. London. A. E. 1977. Cultivation and Herding in Southern Nandi ca. 1840-1914. . 1950. 1951. Kinship and Marriage Among the Nuer. Oxford. Kinship and Marriage Among the Lozi of Northern Rho-

University of Nairobi Staff Seminar Paper. Herskovits, M. 1937. A Note on "Woman Marriage" in Dahomey. Africa 10:

335-341 1969. 'Woman Marriage' in Some East African Societies. Anthropos

63/64: 745-752. Huntingford, G. W. B. 1953. The Nandi of Kenya: Tribal Control in a Pastoral Society, London.

Krige, E. J. 1974. Woman Marriage with Special Reference to the Lovedu—Its Significance for the Definition of Marriage. Africa 44: 11-36.

Krige, E. J., and J. D. Krige. 1943. The Realm of a Rain Queen. London. Langley, M. S. 1979. The Nandi of Kenya: Life Crisis Rituals in a Period of Change. New York.

Leach, E. R. 1969. Virgin Birth. Genesis as Myth and Other Essays. London. Obbo, C. 1976. Dominant Male Ideology and Female Options: Three East Africa.

can Case Studies. Africa 46: 371-389.
Oboler, R. S. 1977. Work and Leisure in Modern Nandi: Preliminary Results of a Study of Time Allocation. Working Paper No. 324. Institute for Develop-

O'Brien, D. 1972. Female Husbands in Altrian Societies, Progressian Association, To-71st Annual Meeting of the American Anthropological Association, Toment Studies, Nairobi.
en. D. 1972. Female Husbands in African Societies. Paper presented at the

fication: A Cross-Cultural View, ed. A. Schlegel, pp. 109-126. New York Riviere, P. G. 1971. Marriage: A Reassessment. Rethinking Kinship and Marriage, ed. R. Needham, pp. 57-74. London.

Sutton, J. E. G. 1970. Some Reflections on the Early History of Western Kenya. Hadith 2: Proceedings of the 1968 Conference of the Historical Association 1977. Female Husbands in Southern Bantu Societies. Sexual Strati-

of Kenya, ed. B. Ogot, pp. 17-29. Nairobi. van Warmelo, N.J., and W. N. D. Phophi. 1948. Venda Law. Ethnological Publication No. 23. Department of Native Affairs. Pretoria.

Preference, Principle, and Precedent: Dispute Settlement and Changing Norms in Sidamo Associations¹

University of Alabama, Birmingham John H. Hamer

groups and co-operatives among the Sadama of southern Ethiopia. A theoretical plane, it is the problem of relating individual preferences of what has been termed "physicalism" to group principles based on norms and values. individual preferences are negotiated in forming new behavioral people and the dispute settlement procedures by which conflicting brief theoretical discussion will be followed by a description of the an integrated value system (Evens 1977:580-81). The situation to be generations must be adapted to fit institutional changes. On a more traditional balance of self-interest and affiliative obligations between The purpose of this paper is to examine what happens when the

rived from integrated rules and standards. tion, claiming instead that these forms of evaluation are in fact deof transactional negotiation become integrated into "overarching value lost." But he tends to assume that individuals bring only distry to assure that the value gained for them is greater or equal to the sults where parties in the course of their interactions systematically the assumption of arbitrary values brought to the transactional situaprinciples of evaluation" (Barth 1964:20). Evens (1977) questions parate values to the interaction situation which through the process behavioral norms are formed by a "transactional process which re-Barth (1966:4) has suggested that new "overarching" values and

and wrongness, as well as behavioral expectations, to social situations. But, to use Moore's (1975) apt phraseology, some form of situational adjustment" is required because of the "indeterminancy" of appropriate values and norms. The basis for making this adjust-It is our contention that individuals do bring concepts of rightness